

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com





Journal of Human Evolution 49 (2005) 781-782

Erratum

Erratum to "New discoveries and interpretations of hominid fossils and artifacts from Vindija Cave, Croatia" [J. Hum. Evol. 46 (1) (2004) 27–67]¹

James C.M. Ahern^{a,*}, Ivor Karavanić^b, Ivor Janković^c, Fred H. Smith^d

^a Department of Anthropology, University of Wyoming, Laramie, WY 82071-3431, USA

^b Department of Archaeology, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Zagreb, Ivana Lučiča 3, 10000 Zagreb, Croatia

^c Institute for Anthropological Research, Amruševa 8, 10000 Zagreb, Croatia

^d Department of Sociology/Anthropology, Loyola University, Chicago, IL 60626, USA

Received 16 August 2005; accepted 18 August 2005

The authors regret that the Vindija Cave fossil specimen Vi 13.10 was misidentified as a hominid scapular fragment. Upon further analysis, it is clear that this specimen is most likely a fragment of carnivore ilium. Although the overall form of the specimen was originally thought to be a robust inferior angle of a hominid scapula, one feature, a circular ligamentous attachment area, has since been identified that is inconsistent with this identification and is most consistent with identification as a small portion of carnivore (likely canid or felid) superior iliac margin. Figure 1 shows the medial aspect (ventral when misidentified as scapula) of Vi 13.10 next to a similarly positioned ilium of *Canis lupus*.

The circular attachment area seen in the Canis ilium and the Vindija specimen is a form of the iliac tuberosity (Evans, 1993). Examination of carnivore innominates housed at the Institute for Quaternary Geology and Paleontology (Zagreb) and the University of Wyoming (Laramie) reveals that the circular form is common among Canis lupus, but not observed among Canis lupus-Canis familiaris hybrids or Canis familiaris. Isolated specimens of *Panthera tigris* (n = 2), *Panthera leo* (n = 1), Felis concolor (n = 5), Ursus arctos (n = 3), *Ursus americanus* (n = 3), and *Canis latrans* (n = 5)also lack this circular iliac tuberosity, yet similar structures are occasionally seen in human ilia. The thickness and shape of the superior iliac border of Vi 13.10 is more similar to the Panthera specimens examined than to those of *Canis lupus*. Thus, given the limited number of Panthera

DOI of original article: 10.1016/j.jhevol.2003.09.010.

^{*} Corresponding author. Department 3431 (Anthropology), 1000 E. university Ave., University of Wyoming, Laramie, WY 82071, USA. Tel.: +1 307 766 4911 (office); fax: +1 307 766 2473.

E-mail addresses: jahern@uwyo.edu (J.C.M. Ahern), ikaravan@ffzg.hr (I. Karavanić), ivor_jankovic@yahoo.com (I. Janković), fsmith3@luc.edu (F.H. Smith).

¹ Maja Paunović (Institute of Quaternary Palaeontology and Geology, Croatian Academy of Sciences and Arts), who was an author of the original paper, passed away in 2003, and thus did not contribute to this correction.



Fig. 1. Ventral aspects of a *Canis lupus* ilium and Vi 13.10. The circular form of the iliac tuberosity is identified by "a" in the figure. The scale is 1 mm.

examined, this genus cannot be ruled out for the identity of the Vindija specimen. Specimen Vi 13.10 likely derives from Vindija stratigraphic unit I. *Canis lupus, Panthera spelaea*, and *Panthera par-dus* are all present in the unit I faunal assemblage (Malez and Ullrich, 1982), and thus Vi 13.10 likely is attributable to one of these species. However, neither *P. spalaea* nor *P. pardus* were available for comparison. The authors thank D. W. Frayer for bringing this issue to their attention.

References

- Evans, H.E., 1993. Skeleton. In: Evans, H.E. (Ed.), Anatomy of the Dog. W.B. Saunders, Philadelphia.
- Malez, M., Ullrich, H., 1982. Neuere paläanthropologische untersuchungen am matrial aus her Höhle Vindija (Kroatien, Jugoslawien). Palaeont. Jugosl. JAZU 29, 1–44.